

THE NATIONAL ACADEMY OF SCIENCES is a private, co-optative society of distinguished scholars in scientific and engineering research, dedicated to the furtherance of science and its use for the general welfare. Its charter, an Act of Incorporation passed by the U.S. Congress and signed by Abraham Lincoln on March 3, 1863, called upon it to serve as an official adviser, upon request and without fee, to the federal government on any question of science or technology.

THE NATIONAL ACADEMY OF ENGINEERING was established in December 1964, under the charter of the National Academy of Sciences, as a parallel organization of distinguished engineers, autonomous in its administration and membership, and sharing with the NAS its responsibility for advising the federal government.

THE NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL was organized by the National Academy of Sciences in 1916 at the request of President Woodrow Wilson. Most of the activities undertaken by the two Academies are carried out through the NRC, which is representative of the major scientific and technical societies, and whose members are derived from universities, industry, and the scientific agencies of the federal government.

THE INSTITUTE OF MEDICINE was chartered by the National Academy of Sciences in the summer of 1970 in recognition of the important and complex problems posed in the provision of adequate health services to all sectors of society. Its members are selected from all fields of health and medicine as well as from related activities in the natural, social and behavioral sciences, law, administration, government service, and engineering.

**Experiments and
Research with
Humans:
Values in Conflict**

February 18-19, 1975

ACADEMY FORUM

Third of a Series



NATIONAL
ACADEMY of
SCIENCES

WASHINGTON, D.C.

OPEN TO THE PUBLIC

**Experiments and Research
with Humans:
Values in Conflict**

FEBRUARY 18

- Charles A. Alford, Jr.*, Meyer Professor of Pediatric Research, Department of Pediatrics and Microbiology, University of Alabama
- Frederick C. Battaglia*, Professor & Chairman, Department of Pediatrics, University of Colorado Medical Center
- Richard E. Behrman*, Carpentier Professor & Chairman, Department of Pediatrics, College of Physicians and Surgeons, Columbia University
- Ivan L. Bennett, Jr.*, Provost, New York University Medical Center & Dean, New York University School of Medicine
- Douglas D. Bond*, Professor of Psychiatry, Case Western Reserve University
- Alvin J. Bronstein*, Executive Director-Counsel, National Prison Project, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation
- Audrey K. Brown*, Professor of Pediatrics & Physical Charge, Pediatric Hematology-Oncology, Downstate Medical Center, State University of New York, Brooklyn
- Leon Eisenberg*, Professor of Psychiatry, Harvard Medical School & Senior Associate in Psychiatry, Children's Hospital Medical Center
- Henry W. Foster*, Professor & Chairman, Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, George W. Hubbard Hospital, Meharry Medical College
- Renée C. Fox*, Professor & Chairman, Department of Sociology, University of Pennsylvania
- Donald S. Fredrickson*, President, Institute of Medicine
- Charles Fried*, Professor of Law, Harvard University Law School
- Charles R. Halpern*, Executive Director, Council for the Advancement of Public Interest Law
- Philip Handler*, President, National Academy of Sciences
- Howard H. Hiatt*, Dean, Harvard School of Public Health
- Maurice R. Hilleman*, Vice President, Merck Sharp & Dohme Research Laboratories
- William N. Hubbard, Jr.*, President, The Upjohn Company
- Franz J. Ingelfinger*, Editor, *New England Journal of Medicine*
- Robert B. Jaffe*, Professor & Chairman, Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, University of California Medical School, San Francisco
- Jay Katz*, Professor (Adjunct) of Law and Psychiatry, Yale Law School
- Charles U. Lowe*, Executive Director, The National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research
- Walsh McDermott*, Special Advisor to the President of The Robert Wood Johnson Foundation
- Richard A. Merrill*, Associate Dean & Professor of Law, University of Virginia School of Law
- Francis D. Moore*, Moseley Professor of Surgery, Harvard Medical School & Surgeon-in-Chief, Peter Bent Brigham Hospital
- Frederick C. Robbins*, Dean, School of Medicine, Case Western Reserve University, Cochairman
- Albert B. Sabin*, Distinguished Research Professor of Biomedicine, Medical University of South Carolina
- William C. Smith*, Staff Attorney, Children's Defense Fund
- Lewis Thomas*, President, Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center, Cochairman

8:00-9:30 a.m.
REGISTRATION, C Street Entrance
Coffee, Great Hall
WELCOME, *Philip Handler*
INTRODUCTION, *Frederick C. Robbins*, Chairman

9:30-12 Noon
PERSPECTIVES OF BIOMEDICAL RESEARCH
A Cultural and Historical View, *Francis D. Moore*
The Benefits of Research, *Lewis Thomas*
The Risks of Research, *Walsh McDermott*
Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

LUNCH

1:30-5:00 p.m.
INDIVIDUAL RISKS vs. SOCIETAL BENEFITS
What Consent is Needed?
Introduction to the Cases, *Renée C. Fox*
The Fetus, *Charles A. Alford, Jr.*, *Frederick C. Battaglia*, *Audrey K. Brown*, *Robert B. Jaffe*
Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

The Child, *Leon Eisenberg*, *Charles R. Halpern*, *William C. Smith*
Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

5:00 p.m.
SUMMARY, *Frederick C. Robbins*

FEBRUARY 18-19, 1975

National Academy of Sciences, Auditorium

FEBRUARY 19

8:00-9:30 a.m.

REGISTRATION, C Street Entrance

Coffee, Great Hall

WELCOME, *Donald S. Frederickson*

INTRODUCTION, *Lewis Thomas*, Chairman

9:30-12 Noon

INDIVIDUAL RISKS vs. SOCIETAL BENEFITS
How are the Risks Distributed?

The Military/The Prisoner, *Alvin J. Bronstein*,
William N. Hubbard, Jr., *Albert B. Sabin*
Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

The Poor, *Henry W. Foster*, *Franz J. Ingelfinger*,
Jay Katz

Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

LUNCH

1:30-5:00 p.m.

**REGULATORY, JUDICIAL, AND
LEGISLATIVE PROCESSES**

**The National Commission for the Protection of
Human Subjects of Biomedical and
Behavioral Research**, *Stuart U. Lowe*

THE PANEL, *Charles Fried*, *Marjorie R. Hilleman*,
Richard A. Merrill

Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

FUTURE POLICY OPTIONS AND SUMMARY

THE PANEL FOR INQUIRY, *Richard E. Behrman*,
Ivan L. Bennett, Jr., *Douglas D. Bond*,
Howard H. Hiatt, *Frederick C. Robbins*,
Lewis Thomas

Inquiry and Commentary by the Forum

5:00 p.m.

CLOSING, *Philip Handler*

DISCUSSANTS

Lawrence K. Altman, Medical Writer, *New York Times*

Cleveland Amory, President, The Fund for Animals

Robert Austrian, John Herr Musser Professor & Chairman,
Department of Research Medicine, University of Pennsylvania

David L. Bazelon, Chief Judge of the United States Court of
Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit

Sissela Bok, Lecturer on Medical Ethics, Harvard Medical
School

Edward L. Buescher, Col. MC, Director, Walter Reed Army
Institute of Research

Robert A. Burt, Professor, University of Michigan Law School
Alexander M. Capron, Assistant Professor of Law, University
of Pennsylvania Law School

Frederick S. Carney, Professor of Ethics, Graduate Program in
Religion, Southern Methodist University

D. T. Chalkley, Chief, Office for Protection from Research
Risks, Office of the Director, National Institutes of Health

James F. Childress, Chairman, Department of Religious
Studies, University of Virginia

Robert Coles, Research Psychiatrist, Harvard University
Health Services

William J. Curran, Professor, Harvard School of Public Health
William J. Darby, President, The Nutrition Foundation

Albert Dorfman, Richard T. Crane Distinguished Service
Professor of Pediatrics and Biochemistry, University of
Chicago

Merlin K. DuVal, Vice President for Health Services, Uni-
versity of Arizona

Arthur J. Dyck, Mary B. Saltonstall Professor of Population
Ethics, Harvard School of Public Health

H. Hugh Fudenberg, Professor and Chairman, Department of
Basic and Clinical Immunology and Microbiology, Medical
University of South Carolina; Professor of Medicine, Uni-
versity of California School of Medicine, San Francisco;
and Professor of Immunology, University of California,
Berkeley

Willard Gaylin, President, Institute of Society, Ethics and the
Life Sciences

Joan Goldstein, Task Force on Women and Health, National
Organization for Women

Samuel Corovitz, Professor & Chairman, Department of
Philosophy, University of Maryland

Andrew M. Greeley, Director, Center for the Study of
American Pluralism, National Opinion Research Center

Robert E. Greenberg, Professor and Chairman, Department of
Pediatrics, Charles R. Drew Postgraduate Medical School,
and President, Society for Pediatric Research

Michael J. Halberstam, Associate Clinical Professor of Internal
Medicine and Cardiology, George Washington University
Hospital

Elizabeth D. Hay, Louise Foote Pfeiffer Professor of Embry-
ology, Department of Anatomy, Harvard Medical School

Andre E. Hellegers, Director, Joseph and Rose Kennedy
Institute for the Study of Human Reproduction and
Bioethics

Peter B. Hutt, Assistant General Counsel, Food and Drug
Division, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare

John H. Knowles, President, The Rockefeller Foundation

Discussants (continued)

- Saul Krugman, Professor, Department of Pediatrics, New York University Medical Center
Louis C. Lasagna, Professor and Chairman, Department of Pharmacology and Toxicology, University of Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry
Brian Little, Professor and Chairman, Department of Reproductive Biology, Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine
Richard A. McCormick, S.J., Rose F. Kennedy Professor of Christian Ethics, Joseph and Rose Kennedy Institute for the Study of Human Reproduction and Bioethics
Frederick Mostell, Professor of Mathematical Statistics, Harvard University
Edmund D. Pellegrini, Director and Chairman of the Board, Yale-New Haven Hospital
Gerald Piel, Ph.D., Editor, *The Scientific American*
Barbara Roberg, Associate Professor, Department of the History of Science, Harvard University
Lois J. Sch. fer, Attorney, Women's Rights Project, Center for Law and Social Policy
George E. Schreiner, Professor of Medicine, Georgetown University Hospital
DeWitt Stetten, Jr., Deputy Director for Science, National Institutes of Health
Christine Stevens, President, Animal Welfare Institute
Michael M. Uhlmann, Assistant General Counsel for Legislation and Congressional Liaison, Federal Trade Commission
Marie A. Valdes-Dapena, Associate Pathologist, St. Christopher's Hospital for Children; Professor of Pathology and Professor in Pediatrics, Temple University School of Medicine
Theodore Woodward, Professor and Chairman, Department of Medicine, University of Maryland Hospital
Sumner J. Yaffe, Professor of Pediatrics, Children's Hospital, Buffalo, and Chairman, Committee on Drugs of the American Academy of Pediatrics

OPEN TO THE PUBLIC

REGISTRATION A registration and information desk will be stationed in the lobby of the C Street entrance to the Academy from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. on February 18-19. Throughout both days there will be a bulletin board for messages at that location. The telephone number for the message center and registration desk is 389-6824. Parking is not available.

There is no registration fee for the Forum.

PROGRAM COMMITTEE

- Frederick C. Robbins, Dean, School of Medicine, Case Western Reserve University, Cochairman
Lewis Thomas, President, Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center, Cochairman
Lawrence K. Altman, Medical Writer, *New York Times*
Robert Austrian, John Herr Musser Professor & Chairman, Department of Research Medicine, University of Pennsylvania
Richard E. Behrman, Carpentier Professor & Chairman, Department of Pediatrics, College of Physicians and Surgeons, Columbia University
William J. Curran, Professor, Harvard School of Public Health
Renée C. Fox, Professor & Chairman, Department of Sociology, University of Pennsylvania
Samuel Corovitz, Professor & Chairman, Department of Philosophy, University of Maryland
Andre E. Hellegers, Director, Joseph and Rose Kennedy Institute for the Study of Human Reproduction and Bioethics
Howard H. Hiatt, Dean, Harvard School of Public Health
William N. Hubbard, Jr., President, The Upjohn Company
Peter B. Hutt, Assistant Counsel, Food and Drug Division, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare
William C. Smith, Staff Attorney, Children's Defense Fund
Sumner J. Yaffe, Professor of Pediatrics, Children's Hospital, Buffalo, and Chairman, Committee on Drugs of the American Academy of Pediatrics

GENERAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

- Robert McC. Adams, Dean, Division of Social Sciences, The University of Chicago, Chairman
Daniel E. Koshland, Jr., Professor & Chairman, Department of Biochemistry, University of California, Berkeley, Acting Chairman
Arthur M. Bueche, Vice President, Corporate Research and Development, General Electric Company
Norman H. Giles, Callaway Professor of Genetics, Department of Zoology, University of Georgia
Gertrude S. Goldhaber, Senior Physicist, Brookhaven National Laboratory
Michael Kasha, Director, Institute of Molecular Biophysics, Florida State University
Rudolf Kompfner, Professor, Department of Engineering Science, University of Oxford, England
Phillip Morrison, Institute Professor, Department of Physics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Frederick C. Robbins, Dean, School of Medicine, Case Western Reserve University
Lewis Thomas, President, Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center
Donald S. Fredrickson, President, Institute of Medicine, Ex-Officio
Robert C. Seamans, Jr., President, National Academy of Engineering, Ex-Officio

FORUM STAFF

- Robert R. White, Director
M. Virginia Davis, Administrative Assistant
Betsy S. Turvene, Editor